Final Report
Research on the Proceedings and Transactions of the Royal Society of Canada, 1898-1947

Ian Wereley, Ph.D.
Postdoctoral Associate
Calgary Institute for the Humanities

Overview

During the summer and winter of 2018, I undertook a research assistantship for a project on the historical role of the Royal Society of Canada (RSC) in Canadian cultural and political policies leading to the marginalization of indigenous peoples and their knowledge. The project was anchored in an exploration first of Duncan Campbell Scott (former RSC President) and then broadened out to the RSC as a whole, during the period of Scott’s involvement in the Society from 1899-1947. I began my research journey guided by the following questions: Who was Duncan Campbell Scott, and what was his relationship with the RSC? What were Scott’s views on indigenous peoples? What platform did the RSC provide Scott for developing and sharing these views?

To answer these questions, I consulted the primary publication of the RSC, the Proceedings and Transactions of the Royal Society of Canada. Over the course of several months I worked in the RSC’s decadent national headquarters, where the Proceedings and Transactions are housed (quite literally) in a well-appointed Victorian mansion, Walter House. I became a close companion with these 1200-page annual volumes. Their richly detailed pages offered me a window into the RSC and its early twentieth-century activities, allowing me to peer into the past in fascinating ways. As I trawled through these pages, I uncovered information that was both enlightening and disconcerting. What I found was an archive pertinent to the history of colonialism and exclusion, and the nucleus of the ideas that brought forth the residential school system in Canada.

In the following report I outline some of the key findings made during my time spent at Walter House. First, I provide context around the RSC of the early twentieth century, and the role the Proceedings and Transactions played in the society’s annual calendar. Next, I discuss the networks of power and influence that undergirded the RSC during this period. Third, I explore the RSC’s role in creating and mobilizing knowledge about indigenous life in Canada, focussing specifically on the contributions made by members of Section II. In the final section, I propose some avenues for future research.
History and Context

The Royal Society of Canada (RSC)

The RSC is a learned society that represents the highest echelons of Canada’s scholars, artists, and professionals. In its own words, the “Royal Society of Canada recognizes leaders and their work in order to help them build a better future in Canada and around the world.”\(^1\) Founded in 1882 by the Governor General Marquis of Lorne, and incorporated by Parliamentary statute a year later, the primary objective of the RSC was to “promote learning and intellectual accomplishments of exceptional quality.”\(^2\) Since then, the RSC honorific (F.R.S.C.) has been used to recognize excellence and to reward outstanding contributions of Canadians working in the arts, humanities and sciences, as well as in Canadian public life. Thousands of Fellows have played a role in the RSC over the years, and many have helped shape the country that we know today. Notable Fellows during the period of this study include the poet Duncan Campbell Scott; the scientist Sir Sanford Fleming; the Under-Secretary of State O.D. Skelton; the Prime Minister William Lyon Mackenzie King; the humorist Stephen Leacock; the publisher Lorne Pierce, and dozens of Chief Justices, Archdeacons, university deans, politicians, and prominent businessmen. It is important to note that women were barred (or at the very least excluded) from participating in the majority of RSC activities during the period covered by this study.

The RSC of the early twentieth century was strictly hierarchical. At the top of the pyramid was the Honorary President, an ex officio position reserved for the sitting Governor General. The highest elected position in the Society was the President, who served a one-year term that usually followed a one-year term as Vice President. Assisting the President and Vice President was the Honorary Secretary, which was an elected position with no term limit. The Honorary Secretary performed many roles, including conducting the majority of official correspondence. Reporting on finances was the responsibility of the Treasurer, who was also elected and served without a term limit. Together, these four executive positions constituted the RSC Council.

The rank and file membership of the RSC was divided between four (eventually five) different sections, each of which was attributed to a major scholarly discipline or field of study. During the period of this study, the RSC was comprised of the following sections.

- Section I: French Literature, History, Archaeology, Sociology, Political Economy and Allied Subjects
- Section II: English Literature, History, Archeology, Sociology, Political Economy and Allied Subjects
- Section III: Mathematical, Chemical and Physical Sciences
- Section IV: Geological Sciences
- Section V: Biological Sciences

Each section had an elected President and Vice-President, as well as several committees and working groups. Examples of these include Printing Committees, Nominating Committees, and Medal Committees. In addition to these recurring committees, the RSC undertook a variety

---

of projects both within Ottawa and across Canada. These special projects were spearheaded by a section or cluster of sections, and they often required the energy, persistence, and/or connections of dozens of Fellows. Many of the initiatives had a significant and lasting impact on the history of Canada. In 1898, the RSC established a commission to produce an Official Register of Canadian Place Names, which was realised in 1905. That same year, Fellows of Section II struck a committed to lobby the Dominion Government to create an official map of Canada. “At present,” stated a Fellow at the Annual Meeting in 1898, “there is no map, large or small, available to the public, and grave inconveniences arise therefrom.” The map was realised several years later. In 1899, the RSC established a committee to accurately measure and define the 98th meridian, much of which was not demarcated.

The RSC was also involved in a variety of cultural and heritage projects during the late nineteenth and early twentieth centuries. In 1899, a coalition of Fellows lobbied the government to construct a national museum in Ottawa. In the words of one Fellow: “It seems to the Council that the Government of the Dominion have now an admirable opportunity of taking a practical step towards giving the Washington of the North some of the aspects of the Washington of the South.” A few years later, in 1903, an RSC commission lobbied the government about the “urgent importance of preserving historical monuments, sites, buildings, archives, and relics throughout Canada in view of the constant and increasing danger of their disappearance.” During this period Fellows of Section II helped to successfully apply for funding from the Carnegie Foundation to build Ottawa’s first Public Library. The Library was built on Metcalf and Gladstone in 1905.

The highlight of the RSC’s annual calendar was the Annual Meeting, which was held over two or three days in May. The vast majority of meetings took place in Ottawa, first at the Normal School and, after 1911, at the Chateau Laurier. Special meetings were held in other Canadian cities, as well, often to coincide with a major anniversary or event. The Annual Meeting of 1904, for example, was held in St. John in celebration of the 300th anniversary of the settlement of Acadia by Champlain and De Monts. The 1909 Annual Meeting was held in Winnipeg, Manitoba, in concert with the British Association’s special conference held in that city.

Each Annual Meeting was structured in relatively the same manner. On the first day, the entire RSC body gathered for the opening ceremony and call to order. At this meeting, elections for RSC Council positions were held and new Fellows were inducted and introduced. The Fellows also heard reports from associated societies and institutions across Canada, and learned about RSC finances and the status of special projects. The general assembly ended with the delivery of the Presidential Address. The topic (and length) of these presentations varied greatly, but they all contained fascinating information about the President, the RSC, and Canada at that particular moment in time. Notable examples include:

---

3 1898, xiv.
4 1898, xvi.
5 1899, xxii.
6 1899, xvii.
7 1903, xxxvii.
8 1903, xxxi.
9 1907, xi.
• Sir James Grant, “Brain Power and How to Preserve It” (1903)
• William Saunders, “Agricultural Progress” (1907)
• Rev. Dr. George Bryce, “The Canadianization of Western Canada” (1910)
• W.D. LeSueur, “History: Its Nature and Methods” (1913)\(^{10}\)

During the second day of the Annual Meeting, fellows broke off into their respective sections to hold smaller, more specific meetings. These gatherings also included a call to order, general business, updates on projects, and the induction of new Fellows. There was often an Address delivered by the President of the section, followed by the reading of research papers written by Fellows.\(^{11}\) Generally, four to seven papers were read in full by their authors or by another Fellow on their behalf, with another ten to twenty papers announced by title only. A useful bibliography of papers presented to Section II during the period 1882-1924 can be found in Lawrence Burpee’s Presidential Address to that section in 1925.\(^{12}\)

**The Proceedings and Transactions of the Royal Society of Canada**

The history of the RSC during the late nineteenth and early twentieth centuries is recorded in a series of annual volumes titled *The Proceedings and Transactions of the Royal Society of Canada*. The *Proceedings and Transactions*, as they are generally referred to, contain a wealth of information about the RSC and its diverse activities. Some information is mundane but nonetheless valuable, such as the biographical details of Fellows and Council Members. Other information is exceptionally rich, specifically accounts of the Society’s projects and initiatives in any given year. The minutes of the Annual Meeting are particularly revealing. In addition to these details about the RSC itself, the *Proceedings and Transactions* also include an updated list of Canadian learned societies and their activities; reports from major international learned societies; statistics from Canadian meteorological and tidal stations, and much more. With such a wealth of information contained within, it is perhaps not surprising that the *Proceedings and Transactions* are massive in size. The 1913 volume, for example, contains 992 pages of text and is about 5 inches thick. Despite their unwieldiness, they were widely read (or at least distributed). Each RSC Fellow was given a copy of the *Proceedings and Transactions*, as were major universities, libraries, research institutions, and learned societies across Canada. The RSC also distributed a significant number of volumes to international libraries, universities, and learned societies. In 1913, 1260 copies of the *Proceedings and Transactions* were printed and distributed, and a further 5400 copies of individual papers were printed and mailed to their respective authors.

---


\(^{11}\) A notable example for Section II was Rev. Dr. Burwash’s 1907 Address, “Our Canadian Literature.” Xvi, 3.

Key Findings

Networks of Knowledge and Power

One of the primary findings of this research is that complex networks of knowledge and power undergirded the RSC during the early twentieth century. The Proceedings and Transactions reveal that RSC Fellows used an intricate web of personal and professional friendships to raise awareness of a particular issue, push special initiatives to completion, and to accrue power within the Society. The RSC was a closed white male club akin to those that operated in London, Oxford, and Edinburgh. In many respects, who Fellows knew was as important (if not more) than what they knew. Notable attendees at the Annual Meeting during the period of this study included Governors General of Canada, Ambassadors of foreign countries, and members of the British Royal Family. As the RSC included some of Canada’s most elite scholars, businessmen, and politicians, these networks of Fellows wielded immense power. The RSC often functioned as a crucial bridge between government, academia, and local communities across Canada. In 1914, for example, a large delegation of RSC Fellows met with the Minister of Labour, Thomas Crothers, to discuss a ban on the use of phosphorous in the production of matches. Later that year, legislation was passed to officially ban the substance in Canadian matches. “The Government is to be congratulated,” the Committee Chairman stated proudly at the RSC Annual Meeting.

Another major finding of this research is related to the patronage system that RSC Fellows relied upon for their upward advancement within the Society. This system of favours and recognitions began even before a Fellow was inducted. All new Fellows, for example, had to be nominated and elected by a group of existing Fellows, often under the auspices of a Nominating Committee. Thus, incoming Fellows began their tenure in the Society under a form of debt to higher ranking Fellows. Once a full member, Fellows could affix the letters F.R.S.C. to their official title, attend the Annual Meeting and share their research. After several years of active service, Fellows began to advance through the ranks of the RSC hierarchy. The success of a Fellow’s upward mobility was determined by the strength of their personal and professional friendships. An instructive case study can be found in the career trajectory of Duncan Campbell Scott. Elected a Fellow in 1898, Scott expertly navigated the inner politics of the RSC, eventually holding practically every position that was available to him. In 1901, he was elected Vice President of Section II, and the following year he served a term as its President. He was elected to the Printing Committee of Section II in 1903 and 1904, and that section’s powerful Nominating Committee in 1909. Scott received a significant advancement in 1911 when he was elected as the Honorary Secretary, an executive position on the RSC Council that had far reaching duties and power. In this role, Scott was a voting member of the Council, he introduced all new Fellows at the Annual Meeting, and he conducted all official correspondence of the Society. Being Honorary Secretary also enabled Scott to expand his networks of power beyond the confines of the RSC. He wrote frequently to Ministers and other

---

13 See for example, Earl Grey; the French Ambassador to the US, Jean Jusserand; the Duke and Duchess of Connaught, and HRH Princess Patricia. Ramsay Wright, “The Progress of Biology,” 1911, xvii, xxxvii; Lt.-Col. H.C. Lowther, “Big Game,” 1912, xxvii.
14 1914, xii-xiii.
officials in the Canadian Government, and he was responsible for crafting the RSC’s annual letter to the Governor General. Scott also handled the RSC’s special communications, such as invitations, letters of sympathy, and various public announcements.

The position of Honorary Secretary afforded Scott a great deal of influence within the RSC, and he appears to have exercised it liberally. One of his first actions, for example, was to put forward a motion that established a new fund of $300 for the exclusive use of the Honorary Secretary.\(^{15}\) Attached to Scott’s motion was a call to amend the RSC by-laws to stipulate that all future Presidents and Vice Presidents must have first served a term as Honorary Secretary.\(^{16}\) Both motions were approved. Ten years later, in 1921, Scott was elected President of the RSC.

Scott did not become RSC President by chance. He relied upon a vast and complex network of power that often played out in subtle ways. Scott’s influence within the Society is manifest throughout the *Proceedings and Transactions*. Indeed, there are volumes during the 1910s in which it seems that his name appears on every page. For example, in Lawrence Burpee’s comprehensive “Canadian Bibliography of the Year 1901,” presented at the RSC Annual Meeting in 1902, ten of Scott’s publications are recorded – far more than most other authors on the list.\(^{17}\) Scott was also frequently mentioned in RSC Presidential Addresses. W.D. Lighthall noted Scott’s work in his 1918 Presidential Address on “Canadian Poets of the Great War,” in which he praised the “exquisite sonnet, *Ottawa Before Dawn*.”\(^{18}\) In 1920, the President of Section II, W. Lawson Grant, dedicated a significant section of his untitled address to Scott’s poetry.\(^{19}\) RSC President Sir Robert Falconer also heaped praise on Scott in his address entitled, “The Intellectual Life of Canada as Reflected in its Royal Society.”\(^{20}\)

Scott was a strong advocate for his friends and allies. He frequently presented his colleagues’ research at the RSC Annual Meeting, and he supported their special projects through voting and volunteering. Edward Sapir is an instructive example. In 1913, Scott delivered Sapir’s paper on “A Girl’s Puberty Ceremony Among the Nootka Indians” to the Fellows of Section II.\(^{21}\) As Vice-President in 1921, Scott presented Sapir’s essay on “The Nature of Chinese Verse.”\(^{22}\) In his Presidential Address of 1922, titled “On Poetry and Progress,” Scott reserved several moments of praise for his RSC friends and colleagues.\(^{23}\)

**Colonialism, Racism, and the RSC’s Treatment of Indigenous Issues**

A second major finding to come out of this research is the RSC’s role in creating and mobilising knowledge about Indigenous peoples, cultures, and ways of living. The *Proceedings and Transactions* reveal that all of the knowledge produced and celebrated by RSC Fellows took

\(^{15}\) 1911, xx. It is worth noting that the outgoing Honorary Secretary declined to accept a sum of $300 offered to him.

\(^{16}\) 1911, xx.

\(^{17}\) Lawrence Burpee, “A Canadian Bibliography of the Year 1901,” 1902, 295-296.


\(^{19}\) W. Lawson Grant, “Presidential Address, Section II: No Title,” 1920, np.


\(^{23}\) Duncan Campbell Scott, *Poetry and Progress*, 1922, xlvii-lxvii.
place within a context of colonialism, whereby powerful elites gathering in Ottawa sought to conquer and control vast swathes of the Canadian landscape. Specifically, the RSC provided a forum for discussing the colonization of First Nations, Métis, and Inuit Peoples, and through the *Proceedings and Transactions* the Society produced an extensive archive of ideas and strategies for handling what many Fellows understood to be an Indigenous “problem” for Canada. As other researchers working on this topic have shown, RSC Fellows of the early twentieth century played a significant role in creating the intellectual architecture upon which policies such as the residential school system were built.

Even a cursory reading of the *Proceedings and Transactions* of the early twentieth century reveals that they are saturated with ideas about race and colonialism. Often, these themes were expressed through articles that praised “science and technology,” or that told stories about “progress” and the benefits of “Western civilization.” At the same time, the *Proceedings and Transactions*’ table of contents reveals that the RSC was fascinated and, at times, engrossed by Indigenous issues. The volume for 1915, for example, included the following papers in Section II:

- S.G.M. Paul Bruchesi, “Le Problème des Races au Canada”
- Wilbur H. Siebert, “The Loyalists and Six Nation Indians in the Niagara Peninsula”
- W.F. Ganong, “Indian Place-Nomenclature of Maritime Provinces”
- Edward Sapir, “The Social Organization of the West Coast Tribes”

Another notable volume dedicated to Indigenous issues was the *Proceedings and Transactions* of 1920 (the year of Scott’s Vice Presidency), which included papers published by:

- William Riddell, “The Slave in Canada”
- Diamond Jenness, “The ‘Blond’ Eskimos”
- Edward Sapir [read by Duncan Campbell Scott], “The Life of a Nootka Indian”

A deeper reading of these articles reveals that the vast majority of RSC Fellows who spoke and wrote about Indigenous issues viewed them with mixtures of curiosity, indifference, and contempt. Rich examples of these mentalities can be found in research papers published by:

- C.C. James, “The Downfall of the Huron Nation” (1906)
- Robert N. Wilson, “The Sacrificial Rite of the Blackfoot” (1907)
- Rev. Nathaniel Burwash, “The Gift to a Nation of Written Language” (1911)

In the latter paper, Nathaniel Burwash discussed the “intellectual future of our Indian tribes,” revealing a bleak and nihilistic vision of Canadian Indigenous peoples and their

---

knowledge systems. Burwash seems to have had a receptive audience among his RSC Fellows during this period, and he was not alone in his way of thinking. Several other major personalities spoke and wrote about Indigenous peoples. Reverend Charles Hill-Tout, for example, often referred to Indigenous peoples as part of the fauna of Canada, as if they were akin to stocks of fish or caribou. For notable examples of this work, see his 1898 paper on the “Oceanic Origin of the Kwakiutt-Nootka and Salish stocks of British Columbia, and Fundamental Unity of same, with additional notes on the Dèné,” as well as his 1908 paper on “Totemism: Its Origin and Import.” William Douw Lighthall, President of the RSC from 1918-1919, was another promoter of discriminatory attitudes toward Canadian Indigenous peoples. Douw’s specialty was tracking civilizational progress across the world and, in his assessment, indigenous ways of life in Canada were stagnant, if not atemporal – their progress halted irrecoverably by “Anglo-Saxon supremacy on the American continent.” For other notable examples of Douw’s work, see:

- “Hochelagans and Mohawks: A Link in Iroquois History” (1899)
- “Thomas Pownall, his services to the Anglo-Saxon race” (1904)
- “Defective English Spoken in Canada” (1913)
- “Signposts of Prehistoric Time” (1916)

Duncan Campbell Scott was one of the most active contributors to RSC discussions about race, colonialism, and Indigenous issues in Canada. Crucially, Scott’s views about these topics were not confined to his poetry. Rather, Scott sought to influence conversations and policies on the ground in places across Canada. For example, in 1902, as President of Section II, Scott created a special commission tasked with producing an “Ethnological Survey of Canada.” The project’s central aim was to catalogue the different “types” of people living in the country. Its work was divided into “The White Races” and “The aborigines or Indians.” A secondary goal of the commission was to lobby the Federal Government to invest in a series of “national and provincial museums of ethnology.” Throughout the period of this study, Scott presented his friends and colleagues’ research on Indigenous issues:

- R. N. Wilson, “The Sacrificial Rite of the Blackfoot” (1909)

---

28 W.D. Lighthall, “Thomas Pownall, his services to the Anglo-Saxon race,” 1904, xvii; 265.
30 1902, xiv, xli; 1903, xxvi.
• Thomas Drummond, “The Canadian Snowshoe” (1916)\textsuperscript{31}

Conclusion

This report has outlined some of the key findings that were made during my reading of the RSC’s annual *Proceedings and Transactions*. My goal has been to trace the role of Duncan Campbell Scott within the RSC as a means to open an investigation into the ways by which he and his colleagues regarded indigenous peoples, places and ways of living. This research was guided by the following questions: Who was Duncan Campbell Scott, and what was his relationship with the RSC? What were Scott’s views on indigenous issues? What platform did the RSC provide Scott for developing and sharing these views?

What I found during my research journey were a series of extraordinary contradictions. The *Proceedings and Transactions* reveal the RSC’s desire to preserve and protect Canadian history and heritage, while at the same time they expose an eagerness to erase the legacy of Indigenous culture from Canada’s shared history. In some volumes, the RSC appeared genuinely concerned about the health and wellbeing of certain Canadians, such as the example of phosphorous matches. Indigenous Canadians, on the other hand, were viewed in demeaning ways that excluded them as equal citizens. Indeed, one can find in the *Proceedings and Transactions* some of Canada’s best and brightest engaging in some of the worst and darkest ideas in this country’s history.

In sum, what has been uncovered during this research is an archive pertinent to the history of colonialism and settler-colonial relations in Canada. This report seeks to offer an introduction to those interested in learning more about these fascinating and increasingly relevant histories, and to provide avenues for future investigation. The RSC of today cannot be held responsible for the attitudes and actions of the past. The Society does, however, have a unique opportunity to make a meaningful difference for the future. The *Proceedings and Transactions* can and should be a valuable site for research, understanding, and reconciliation.
Appendices

Duncan Campbell Scott’s Positions within the RSC:

- Death notice in Transactions, 1948
- Member of the General Nominating Committee, Flavelle and Tyrell Medals (1930-1931)
- Convenor, Section II Special Endowment Committee (1929)
- Awarded RSC Lorne Pierce Medal (1927)
- Chairman of the Advisory Committee, Section II (1925-1926, 1931-1932)
- Member of the Editorial Committee, Section II (1924-1926, 1931-1932)
- Member of the Advisory Committee, Section II (1923-1924, 1927-1929)
- Member of the RSC Council (1924-1933)
- President (1921-1922)
- Vice President (1920-1921)
- Member of the General Printing Committee (1915-1920)
- Committee to Design New RSC Seal (1913)
- Honorary Secretary (1911-1920)
- Member of the Nominating Committee, All Sections (1909)
- Member of the Printing Committee, Section II (1903, 1904)
- President of Section II (1902-1903)
- Vice President of Section II (1901-1902)
- Fellow – Section II (1899-1948)

Key Personalities of Interest (in order of prominence):

- Duncan Campbell Scott, President
- Rev. Dr. George Bryce, President
- William Douw Lighthall, President
- William Renwick Riddell
- C.-Marius Barbeau
- Lorne Pierce
- Charles Hill-Tout
- Edward Sapir
- Rev. Chancellor Nathaniel Burwash
- Lawrence J. Burpee

Future Research Projects

- Updated Wikipedia entries for Key Personalities
- Updated entries in the Canadian Dictionary of National Biography
- Updated entries in the Canadian Encyclopedia
- A comparative study of French (Section I) and English (Section II) content
- Indexing of the Transactions, creation of Finding Aid
- Digitization of the Transactions
- An official history of the Transactions and RSC engagement with Indigenous issues